



**IFLA Cataloguing Section  
FRBR Review Group**

## **Meeting Report Milan, Italy, August 25 and 26, 2009**

The FRBR Review Group had two meetings on the occasion of the World Library and Information Congress in Milan.

Attendance: 9 members, 13 liaisons and observers (see Appendix A).

### **Meeting 1 (Business meeting)**

#### **1) Welcome and Announcements**

Alan Danskin sent regrets as he was unable to attend IFLA this year. The chair thanked Anders Cato, Alan Danskin, and Glenn Patton, the outgoing members of the FRBR Review Group, for their contributions during their terms.

The WG on Aggregates had two meetings scheduled during the conference: August 25, 2009, 11:30-13:00 and August 27, 2009, 8:00-9:30.

As the second meeting of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee was on Aug. 26th immediately prior to the second meeting of the FRBR RG, items which needed to be reported at the SCII were placed on the agenda of the first meeting.

#### **2) Election results**

At the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee meeting, 5 members were elected or re-elected by acclamation for the term 2009 to 2013.

Re-elected for a second term: Pat Riva and Maja Žumer

New members elected:

Rajesh Chandrakar, Information and Library Network Centre, Ahmedabad, India;

Gordon Dunsire, University of Strathclyde, Scotland;

Miriam Säfström, BTJ, Sweden.

#### **2.1) Recommendation to SCII for RG chair for 2009-2011**

The RG unanimously recommended that Pat Riva continue as chair for another 2-year term. [Confirmed at Standing Committee meeting]

### **3) Chair's report**

#### **3.1) Translations**

The Russian translation, which had been completed in 2006, was posted on the FRBR translations page this year as well as the expression amendment in Russian. A correction to the German version was posted. We were recently contacted for permission to translate into Catalan. We have had no news on progress with the Portuguese or Vietnamese translations. The expression amendment is not yet translated into all the languages in which the FRBR report is available. The chair will contact members representing the missing languages.

#### **3.2) Finances / special project funds**

The RG was granted 1500 euros per year for 2009 and 2010 from special project funds to support IFLA member attendance to meetings relating to harmonisation with archival models. For the 2009 funds, expenses for Patrick and Maja for the FRBR/CRM meeting held in May 2009 are eligible, details of expenses are needed. Members needing funding to attend the planned meeting in Helsinki should indicate it. As the meetings held in conjunction with the CIDOC conference were in 2008, these expenses are probably not eligible.

#### **3.3) Links with other projects / bodies**

The chair was an ex-officio member of the IME ICC committee chaired by Barbara Tillett. This was a great deal of work, but a very important project. The resulting statement was approved in December 2008, and published in June 2009. Links to CIDOC CRM are ongoing. Gordon Dunsire is the liaison for vocabulary mapping initiatives for the RG.

#### **3.4) Presentations and publications**

The chair and several members gave presentations on the FRBR/FRAD models throughout the year, particularly in conjunction with preparation for RDA. The article *Modélisation conceptuelle de l'information bibliographique et muséologique : CIDOC CRM et FRBRoo* by Patrick Le Boeuf was accepted for publication in *Documentation et bibliothèques*, v.55, no 4 (Oct.-Dec. 2009) in a theme issue on the intersection between library/information sciences and museum studies.

### **4) Terms of Reference revision**

An update to the terms of reference of the Review Group, last updated in 2007, is needed to reflect the expanded scope of activity beyond FRBR itself due to the completion and publication of FRAD in June 2009, and to facilitate the eventual transfer of responsibility for FRSAD. As FRAD and FRSAD were developed as parts of the "FRBR family" with the intention that the three models together would form a complete model of the bibliographic universe, it is natural that a single Review Group have ongoing responsibility for all three. The Cataloguing Section Standing Committee at its first meeting indicated its support for the FRBR RG to pursue this direction.

Thus, the RG proposed the following updated terms of reference (adopted at the Standing Committee meeting):

- Review and maintain IFLA's FRBR family of conceptual models on an ongoing basis, developing revisions when needed;
- Develop and make available guidelines and interpretative documents to assist those applying the models;
- Promote the models and encourage their use in all appropriate information organising communities and maintain links with relevant groups both within IFLA and in other communities.

## **5) Cataloguing Section Strategic Plan 2009-2011, FRBR section**

Revisions to the Strategic Plan consistent with the expanded scope of the RG and the revised wording of the terms of reference were also prepared to be proposed to the Standing Committee.

## **6) FRBR Bibliography**

### **6.1) Definition of scope**

It was agreed that the bibliography should include only publications on the FRBR, FRAD and FRSAD models themselves, training on the models, and studies specifically investigating issues (such as user studies) relating to the models. Publications whose focus is on cataloguing codes which are based on FRBR (such as RDA and REICAT), even if FRBR is referred to, should not be included, otherwise the bibliography will become too voluminous to handle.

The bibliography should have a section specifically on the FRAD model. The FRBR web pages are to include FRAD where appropriate. The publications page will have a section for the FRAD report and its translations, the studies and papers section will include other documents prepared by FRANAR, in particular, the Numbering paper and the former appendix on the modeling of the current authority records environment.

### **6.2) Proposal for new format, new updating process**

Gordon reported that it should be possible to transform the bibliography from a document file to a web database which can be kept up to date with contributions by members. However, the entries will need to be reformatted for the transfer. Gordon will set up an entry format and the instructions will be posted on the RG wiki. As the bibliography is now 56 pages long, each of the 8 members will be responsible for 6 or 7 pages each.

## **7) Namespace for FRBR entities/elements in RDF**

### **7.1) Report on policy issues**

Gordon Dunsire reviewed the issues included in his report dated Aug. 4, 2009. The RG concurred with all three recommendations. Thus to fully reflect the FRBR model as it stands, particularly the domains and ranges of the relationships, the entity **family** will not be included in group 2 until the FRAD and FRBR models are integrated.

The appendix to the report reviews issues related to the management of namespaces within IFLA. So far at least FRBR and ISBD are actively pursuing the creation of namespaces, and other standards are likely to follow suit. The logical outcome is the desire to provide dereferencing and other terminology services which

would be supported by those namespaces. The maintenance of namespaces, once created, requires, at a minimum, version control and associated change alerts. The promotion and use of the namespaces raises additional possibilities (provision of an API, exposing the namespace as linked data, provision of authoritative mappings and RDF schema) which, if pursued, require more effort and time from IFLA headquarters technical staff and need to be discussed further once the initial steps are taken.

The organisational context in which IFLA pursues standards activities in a semantic web environment is not presently clear. Several sections and core programs work on standards and models with no coordinating body or forum. The Review Group supports the proposal that a working group be created to investigate IFLA's role in bibliographic standards with the intention of making recommendations to ensure the sustainability of bibliographic standards work within the IFLA structure, and will name at least one member to this cross-Section working group.

### **7.2) Report on Vocabulary Mapping Framework project**

Gordon is also co-investigator for the VMF project, FRBR is one of the source vocabularies within the project scope. Miriam was named to the VMF advisory group to represent FRBR.

## **8) Other business**

Glenn Patton reported that IFLA had granted a request from ALA Publishing to use definitions from FRBR and FRAD in the RDA product. Having the actual definitions used in RDA fits naturally with the point in the strategic plan of having the main principles of FRBR and FRAD reflected in cataloguing codes.

## **Agenda, Meeting 2 (Working meeting)**

### **1) Namespace domain within IFLA**

Continued the discussion of technical issues relating to namespace creation. "\*\*\*\*\*"  
The IFLA Webmaster joined the meeting for this agenda item. Gordon briefly reviewed the background and work to date. The Webmaster will register an appropriately branded domain name, separate from that of the IFLA website. He will need to identify an appropriate application that manages the namespace that can be implemented on the IFLA servers, and assess the time and effort this will require. The potential traffic when providing dereferencing services is an issue, although the namespace can be copied if an application expects to make heavy use of it. The Webmaster will be our contact and conduit for all these technical aspects of the namespace work.

### **2) Discussions from Wiki**

#### **2.1) Revisions for FRBR sections 3.2.5 and 3.2.6, Person and Corporate Body**

The revised wording for these two sections is close to being final on the wiki.

#### **2.2) Attributes of FRBR group 1 entities**

Issues relating to any of the attributes reported to date are listed on the wiki. Several attributes have had their levels questioned.

Some attributes have wording corrections suggested.

An overall approach to this issue is needed to provide a framework for revision. What is an attribute? Which attributes are of sufficient importance to be listed in the report?

### **3) Unified conceptual model**

The ultimate goal is a single conceptual model statement. Even though FRAD and FRSAD were originally charged as extensions of FRBR, their results have taken fresh looks at various aspects. Integrating these three reports will certainly raise some basic issues.

The FRANAR WG promises to send a list of the impact of FRAD on FRBR as they see it. This is an initial list of issues/areas to revise and does not need to include completely worked out revised wording.

Brainstorming relating to areas where harmonisation may be needed to present a unified statement combining FRBR and FRAD, and then FRBR/FRAD/FRSAD:

Group 2 entities: the entity Family and the definition of Person from FRAD;  
Name and Controlled access point entities;

Group 3 entities which are not specified in FRSAD.

Preparatory for further work: reviewing FRBR and FRAD and taking note of any and all issues that will require resolution in the preparation of an integrated model.

The practical scope of the combined document (what sections should it include) needs to be defined. Initial feeling is that it should contain only the model itself (entities, attributes, relationships) and the user tasks. The original introductory material would remain in the original reports. The definition of the Basic National Bibliographic Record (which has no FRAD or FRSAD equivalents) should be housed in another document. This latter project could become a collaboration with the ISBD RG.

## Appendix A

### List of participants

| <b>Name</b>         | <b>Institution</b>                            | <b>Country</b> | <b>Status</b>   | <b>Meeting</b>     |
|---------------------|---|----------------|---|--------------------|
| Aagaard, Harriet    | Stockholm Public Library                      | Sweden         | observer  | Aug. 25            |
| Barbarić, Ana       | University of Zagreb                          | Croatia        | observer, secretary of the Cataloguing Section                                    | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Cato, Anders        | National Library of Sweden                    | Sweden         | outgoing member, member of the WG on Aggregates, chair of the Cataloguing Section | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Dunsire, Gordon     | Strathclyde University                        | UK             | incoming member   | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Escolano, Elena     | National Library                              | Spain          | observer, chair of ISBD RG  | Aug. 25            |
| Hostage, John       | Harvard Law School                            | USA            | ex-officio, liaison between Cataloguing Section and CC:DA                         | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Howarth, Lynne      | University of Toronto                         | Canada         | observer  | Aug. 25            |
| Kuhagen, Judith     | Library of Congress                           | USA            | observer, member of the WG on Aggregates  | Aug. 25            |
| Leresche, Françoise | Bibliothèque nationale de France              | France         | member  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| McGarry, Dorothy    | University of California, Los Angeles         | USA            | observer  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Mercum, Tanja       | University of Ljubljana                       | Slovenia       | observer  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Murtomaa, Eeva      | National Library of Finland                   | Finland        | member, member of the WG on Aggregates  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| O'Neill, Ed         | OCLC  | USA            | chair of the WG on Aggregates   | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Patton, Glenn       | OCLC  | USA            | outgoing member, chair of FRANAR  | Aug. 25            |
| Pisanski, Jan       | University of Ljubljana                       | Slovenia       | observer  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Riva, Pat           | Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec | Canada         | Chair of FRBR RG  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |

|                        |   |          |   |                    |
|------------------------|---|----------|---|--------------------|
| Roe, Sandy             | Cataloging and Classification Quarterly | USA      | observer  | Aug. 25            |
| Säfström, Miriam       | BTJ                                     | Sweden   | incoming member   | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Smith-Yoshimura, Karen | OCLC Research                           | USA      | observer  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Tillett, Barbara       | Library of Congress                     | USA      | member, member of the WG on Aggregates  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| van Spanje, Daniel     | OCLC EMEA                               |          | observer  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Willer, Mirna          | University of Zagreb                    | Croatia  | observer  | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |
| Žumer, Maja            | University of Ljubljana                 | Slovenia | member, member of the WG on Aggregates and WG on FRBR/CRM Harmonisation, co-chair of FR SAR | Aug. 25<br>Aug. 26 |