IFLA Cataloguing Section
FRBR Review Group

Meeting Report
Durban, August 21, 2007

The FRBR Review Group had one meeting on the occasion of the World Library and Information Congress in Durban, on Tuesday, August 21st, 2007. It was attended by 12 participants from 6 countries (see Appendix A).

1) Welcome and Announcements

Members Alan Danskin and Carol van Nuys sent regrets as they were unable to attend IFLA this year.

At SC I the Cataloguing Section established the position of liaison between the Cataloguing Section and the Joint Steering Committee for the Development of RDA, which would include ex-officio membership in both the FRBR and ISBD Review Groups. Marg Stewart (Library and Archives Canada) was confirmed as liaison, and ex-officio FRBR RG member.

2) Elections

i) Review Group membership election results from Cataloguing Section SC I meeting on August 18:

Three members had terms either ending or up for renewal in 2007.

Barbara Tillett was both eligible and willing for renewal, and was re-elected. Following a call for nominations posted on CATSMAIL, two valid nominations were received for the two remaining vacancies, thus both were acclaimed. Françoise Leresche (who was unable to attend IFLA) and Eeva Murtomaa will serve 4-year terms starting in 2007 to 2011 with eligibility for renewal.

ii) Proposal of chair of FRBR RG for 2007-2009:

The RG recommended that Pat Riva serve a second 2-year term as chair.

[Confirmed at SC II meeting on August 24.]

3) Chair's report

i) FRBR translations: German, Hungarian and Swedish were completed.

ii) The chair represented the FRBR Review Group at the following conferences:

Northern California Technical Processes Group (NCTPG) Annual Meeting and Program, San Francisco, April 27, 2007 was entirely on FRBR: Pat Riva presented a talk entitled *"FRBR, understanding current developments"*

Journée RERO (Réseau des Bibliothèques de Suisse occidentale), Lausanne, Switzerland, May 24, 2007: Pat Riva presented a talk entitled *"Un aperçu du modèle FRBR et de ses applications"*

IME-ICC5, Pretoria, Aug. 14-15, 2007: Pat Riva presented *Brave new FRBR world* which had been slightly updated by Pat Riva and Patrick Le Bœuf.

iii) The chair is unable to accept an invitation to speak at the 3rd Encuentro de catalogación in Buenos Aires, Nov. 28-30, 2007, due to proximity with the next FRBR/CRM Harmonisation working group meeting. However, RG members Barbara Tillett and Glenn Patton, as well as ISBD RG chair Elena Escolano, are presenting on other topics.

iv) FRBR publications:

The August/September 2007 issue of the *Bulletin of the American Society for Information Science and Technology* (v.33, no.6) features a special section on FRBR edited by Yin Zhang, which includes articles by Pat Riva, Maja Žumer, Allyson Carlyle, Athena Salaba, Yin Zhang, Shawne D. Miksa.

Pat Riva contributed an entry on FRBR to the forthcoming Greek LIS encyclopedia being prepared by the Deltos Research Group. A new Italian LIS encyclopedia also includes an FRBR entry.

v) *ICBC*: Patrick is intending to contribute an update on FRBRoo for the Oct./Dec. 2007 issue, deadline is Sept. 15.

vi) Communications: The FRBR RG did not contribute to SCATNews this past year. But we will this coming year, particularly to publicize the expression amendment and FRBRoo. An update on the expression amendment will also be offered to *ICBC*. Now that the CATSMAIL list is open to subscribers beyond the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, it is also a good place to post announcements, such as the hoped-for approval of the expression amendment.

vii) In spite of asking everyone to search, we were unable to find a copy of the 1998 FRBR text in word processing format, thus John Hostage converted the PDF from the website into RTF. This is a huge contribution and will make it feasible to integrate the expression amendment, and other future amendments, into the text itself so that the FRBR text link will go to the complete current version. Two minor typos were found and will be corrected silently as they do not affect translation. However, some errata in the examples have been pointed out during the expression world-wide review; these will be noted along with the amendment announcement, to assist translators in keeping their language versions current.

viii) FRBR bibliography: In 2006 David Miller volunteered to link check the entire document. He reports that there were approximately 150 broken links, and that he has so far found new URLs for approximately 2/3 of them. In these cases, he proposes to change the URL without recording the previous one. Some of the remainder will have disappeared from the web, although may still appear in web archives. Current practice retains these in the body of the bibliography, but it makes link checking increasingly difficult. David asks our preference about handling internet references that no longer exist. The RG feels that the citations should remain in the bibliography, to retain the record of their existence as the documents may have been referenced in other publications. Should they be an appendix? In future, David feels that link checking 1-2 times per year should be enough. David will coordinate the logistics of updating the document with Patrick.

4) Strategic Plan for Cataloguing Section 2007-2009

Updates and a reordering of the FRBR section for inclusion in the strategic plan for the Cataloguing Section for 2007-2009 were proposed, for discussion at SC II.

5) Reports from Working Groups

5.1) WG on Expression Entity (A. Cato)

The proposed amendment as revised following the world-wide review will be reviewed in detail at the WG meeting in the afternoon.

The document will then be forwarded for voting by the Review Group. As this is an election year, both incoming and outgoing RG members will be eligible to vote. Approval is by consensus, that is, no negative votes. Negative votes should, in general, be accompanied by reasons.

The next step will be to send it to the Cataloguing Section for their approval. If this can be completed prior to Nov. 15 we can submit an announcement for the Jan./March 2008 issue of *ICBC* as well as the next issue of SCATNews.

ACTION: Recognize the completion of the work of this WG, and recommend to SC II that it be considered complete.

5.2) WG on Aggregates (E. O'Neill)

The WG meeting in the afternoon to focus on the discussion paper "Modeling Aggregates" drafted by Ed and Maja.

ACTION: Propose to SC II that the mandate of this WG be extended for 2 more years (to 2009).

5.3) WG on FRBR/CRM dialogue (M. Žumer for P. Le Bœuf)

See consolidated minutes of meetings 1-10 at:

http://www.ifla.org/VII/s13/wgfrbr/FRBRCIDOCCRM_ConsolidatedMinutes.pdf

i) Presentation on FRBRoo (M. Žumer)

ii) FRBRoo is likely to reach a sufficiently complete stage for wider distribution this year. While the FRBR RG needs to approve the document, the subsequent steps required in the final approval and consultation process are unclear as the situation is somewhat different from other Cataloguing Section projects. This is a joint project with CIDOC-CRM SIG, thus substantive modifications required by either side need to also be reviewed by the other side. The traditional world-wide review process seems potentially problematic, as FRBRoo is essentially a transposition of FRBRER into an object-oriented framework compatible with CRM rather than a wholly new document. Is world-wide review a requirement for publication by IFLA?

ACTION: Contact Sjoerd Koopman to clarify the formal steps required for the approval process for FRBRoo, and the publication process.

Membership: Patrick reminds that membership is not fixed and that new members may continue to join, active IFLA members are welcome.

6) New project: Namespace for FRBR entities/elements in RDF

Discussions at the Data Model meeting held April 30-May 1, 2007 at the British Library (see: http://www.bl.uk/services/bibliographic/meeting.html) attended by Barbara Tillett, revealed that there is a need for an FRBR namespace in RDF. The RG agrees that it is appropriate that this work be carried out authoritatively under the auspices of the FRBR Review Group. The RG will seek the expertise of volunteer consultants to carry out this project, the specific task defined as being:

To define appropriate namespaces for FRBR (entity-relationship) in RDF and other appropriate syntaxes.

Ed O'Neill volunteered to be the FRBR Review Group's liaison to the project. Gordon Dunsire, Eric Childress, Stu Weibel and Sam Oh have agreed to serve as consultants.

7) FRBR FAQs

i) Proposal for "Introduction to FRBR" section

The suggested selection of 7 introductory readings was approved, with the addition of Pat Riva's article from the ASIST Bulletin. Only resources that consist of connected text (that is, articles or chapters, not PowerPoint slides) were selected. The resources, which represent a variety of approaches, were drawn from the FRBR Bibliography. The revised list will be forwarded for posting on IFLANET. Almost all of these are in English; need suggestions for good introductory articles in other languages.

ii) Prioritize other topics

Insufficient time to either prioritize or brainstorm on content for the answers.

ACTION: Continue by email.

8) Continue examination of chart with suggestions for changes to FRBR

The chart, reorganized by status, had been circulated on Aug. 9. There was general agreement with the organization of items by status (*active*, *postponed*, *rejected*, *out of scope*). Postponed items are subdivided as awaiting either FRBRoo or FRAD. The active items are either assigned to the Aggregates WG or are awaiting initial assessment and/or assignment. However, the final item in the list referred to the Aggregates WG should, instead, be listed as rejected based on the recorded consensus of the 2005 meeting in Oslo.

Discussion continued with the first 5 unassessed items (results included in updated chart). A number of the suggestions involve reassessing the attributes lists for the group 1 entities, or proposals to add attributes. This would probably be best done systematically as a project rather than piecemeal. [Discussion continued during the WG on the Expression Entity meeting slot, as the WG had not needed its whole time. However, need to request a longer meeting slot for the RG in 2008.]

ACTION: The chair will update the chart, circulate, and assign work on priority items.

Appendix A

List of participants

Name	Institution	Country	Status
Cato, Anders	National Library of Sweden	Sweden	member, chair of the WG on the Expression entity, member of the WG on Aggregates, incoming chair of the Cataloguing Section SC
Gorodiskaya, Elena	Russian State Library	Russia	Observer
Hostage, John	Harvard Law School	USA	Ex-officio, liaison between Cataloguing Section and CC:DA
Kuhagen, Judith	Library of Congress	USA	Cataloguing Section SC outgoing chair, member of the WG on Aggregates
Murtomaa, Eeva	National Library of Finland	Finland	new member, member of the WG on Aggregates and of the WG on the Expression entity
O'Neill, Ed	OCLC	USA	member, chair of the WG on Aggregates, member of the WG on the Expression entity
Patton, Glenn	OCLC	USA	member, member of the WG on the Expression entity, chair of FRANAR
Riva, Pat	Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec	Canada	Chair of FRBR RG
Stewart, Marg	Library and Archives Canada	Canada	Ex-officio, liaison between Cataloguing Section and RDA/JSC
Thurston, Patricia	Yale University	USA	observer, member of the WG on Aggregates
Tillett, Barbara	Library of Congress	USA	member, member of the WG on the Expression entity and member of the WG on Aggregates
Žumer, Maja	University of Ljubljana	Slovenia	member, member of the WG on Aggregates and WG on FRBR/CRM Harmonisation, co-chair of FRSAR